

Shared risk assessment: Assurance and improvement plan 2010–13

Dundee City Council



social work
inspection agency



THE SCOTTISH
HOUSING
REGULATOR



HMIe

improving Scottish education
leasachadh foghlam na h-Alba



AUDIT SCOTLAND

Contents

1. Introduction	2	Strategic Priorities	12
The Assurance and Improvement Plan	2	Services	14
Why have we prepared this AIP?	2	Implications for scrutiny activity	15
What do we mean by scrutiny risk assessment?	3	5. Corporate assessment	17
What does proportionate scrutiny mean?	4	Implications for scrutiny activity	18
Baseline scrutiny activity	4	6. Conclusion	20
2. Summary	5	Summary of planned scrutiny activity	20
3. The council's context	8	Appendices	21
Self-evaluation	9	Appendix 1 – Risk assessment	21
4. Delivering outcomes for communities	11	Appendix 2 – Corporate assessment	30
Council planning and approach	11	Appendix 3 – Assurance and Improvement Plan	41

1. Introduction

The Assurance and Improvement Plan

1. The Assurance and Improvement Plan (AIP) sets out the planned scrutiny activity for Dundee City Council for the period from April 2010 to March 2013. It sets out the basis of our risk assessment of the council and the scrutiny response. The scrutiny activity is proportionate based on the assessed risks.
2. This AIP is the product of a collaborative approach adopted by the following scrutiny bodies operating in Dundee City Council:
 - Audit Scotland
 - Care Commission
 - HM Inspectorate of Education (HMIE)
 - Scottish Housing Regulator (SHR)
 - Social Work Inspection Agency (SWIA).

Why have we prepared this AIP?

3. The overall objectives of this collaborative approach are to maximise the efficiency and effectiveness of scrutiny work and minimise the impact of scrutiny activity on the council. This will be achieved by:
 - jointly identifying and monitoring key scrutiny risks through the sharing of intelligence and information
 - coordinating the timing and approach of our audit, inspection, regulation and improvement support activity
 - drawing on, and taking account of each other's work to avoid duplication of effort
 - building on each other's work to maximise its value.
4. The AIP draws on a number of sources of information, including:
 - the Best Value 2 (BV2) pathfinder audit in Dundee City Council (March 2010)
 - reports and data from HMIE, SWIA, SHR and the Care Commission (including published inspection reports and other supporting evidence)
 - the annual audit report to the Controller of Audit and elected members for 2008/09
 - the council's monitoring reports on the Single Outcome Agreement (SOA)
 - local and statutory performance indicators (SPIs).

What do we mean by scrutiny risk assessment?

5. All local government scrutiny bodies have agreed the definition of shared risk assessment as:

'A joint approach using key information about local government to plan scrutiny activity that is proportionate and based on risk'

6. In assessing risk we consider the scale or impact/seriousness of an issue and the likelihood of its occurrence. A serious issue, well managed by the council may not represent a high risk. We also identify areas of uncertainty where insufficient evidence is available to make a judgement, where the evidence is unclear or where the impact of any action taken by a council to address an area of concern is unclear.

7. Serious concerns identified through the shared risk assessment may include areas where the available evidence indicates that:

- performance is poor, slipping or not improving
- service or outcome standards are unacceptable
- improvement is not on track to achieve a target
- locally agreed priorities do not reflect evident and pressing need
- insufficient account is being taken of inequality
- insufficient account is being taken of people whose circumstances make them vulnerable or who are at risk of avoidable harm
- there are question marks about the sustainability of current performance or the achievement of improvements
- processes to support continuous improvement are not well established or are ineffective.

8. We recognise that risk levels will change as significant events occur and as councils take action to address identified risks. Scrutiny bodies, through local area network (LAN) contacts, will maintain awareness of activity, including unit level inspection. As new information comes to light the LAN lead, in consultation with other LAN members will update the AIP as appropriate. LAN members will draw any significant matters to the attention of the LAN lead as they arise. The LAN lead will determine what action should be taken in terms of initiating contact with other LAN members.

9. The council is expected to initiate contact with the LAN lead where significant events occur that are likely to influence scrutiny activity. Councils are encouraged to maintain contact with LAN leads to discuss any concerns arising from the AIP or any joint scrutiny activity.

What does proportionate scrutiny mean?

10. When considering the appropriate level of scrutiny activity for each council we consider the following points to ensure that it is proportionate:
 - Is scrutiny activity the best driver for improvement?
 - If so, how can we tailor that activity to the areas where it will have the most impact?
 - How can we tailor that activity in terms of its frequency, intensity and scope?
 - What is the minimum level of scrutiny required to provide assurance to the public?
 - How can we work together to minimise the impact of the scrutiny activity on the council?

Baseline scrutiny activity

11. The focus of the AIP is strategic scrutiny activity, that is scrutiny activity which is focused at corporate or whole service level. There will also be baseline scrutiny activity at establishment level throughout the period of the AIP; for example, school and residential home inspections. Scrutiny bodies also reserve the right to make unannounced scrutiny visits. These will generally be made in relation to care services for vulnerable client groups.
12. The annual audit of local government also comprises part of the baseline activity for all councils and this includes work necessary to complete the audit of housing benefit and council tax benefit arrangements. In addition, other work may be undertaken as a result of a specific Ministerial request or existing statutory requirements.

2. Summary

In a period of modest rises in its resources there has been a general improvement in the performance of Dundee City Council over the past five years. The council and its partners have strong working relationships and are making progress against many of their objectives for the city. The council is aware of where it needs to improve its performance and ways of working, but progress in some areas has been too slow. The council has a reasonable level of self-awareness and improvement plans are in place, or being introduced, to address a number of specific concerns identified by recent scrutiny activity. However there remains some uncertainty about the implementation and impact of improvement actions and the capacity of the council to drive through significant improvement and change against a backdrop of public sector spending constraint.

As a result the level of scrutiny activity is designed to better understand how well the council is doing in identified areas of uncertainty and to establish the effectiveness of its actions in known areas of concern. This scrutiny activity will be targeted in those areas assessed as highest risk and these are set out in the remainder of this AIP. The AIP gives an overview of the information that informed the risk assessment and shows how this links to the proposed scrutiny response.

13. The shared risk assessment is designed to ensure that corporate scrutiny activity is proportionate and focused on risks. It also helps to identify areas of collaborative working between scrutiny bodies, helping to reduce overall scrutiny levels by removing potential areas of duplication and by creating the conditions for more innovative, joined up scrutiny arrangements.
14. Dundee is Scotland's fourth largest city. After a period of decline the area's population is now showing signs of stabilising. However, there are high levels of deprivation and health and social inequality. Unemployment is above the national average and rising. The council and its partners have a clear and ambitious vision for tackling these issues and are making progress against many of their objectives for the city. This approach is underpinned by a good understanding of the needs and concerns of local people.
15. There are strong relationships among partner organisations in Dundee, with many examples of joint working on projects having a positive impact on the quality of the services delivered. However, partnership working at a strategic level requires to be strengthened.
16. Within the context of the city and its relatively high levels of deprivation there has been a general improvement in service performance over the past five years. However, this improvement has not been consistent in all services with significant concerns raised about housing and services to protect children. The council has reported progress in addressing these issues but the impact remains uncertain at this early stage.
17. Member scrutiny of decision-making and performance needs to improve. The council is generally aware of where it needs to improve its ways of working and has implemented some improvements. However, much of the improvement that has been made has been in response to external pressure (such as inspection). In some important areas where the council has identified a longstanding need to improve its arrangements there has been insufficient commitment or capacity and the pace of change has been too slow.
18. The council has managed its resources prudently over recent years and has made some efficiency savings. However, the existing incremental approach will not be sufficient to meet the significant

challenges that lie ahead for public sector services. In recognition of this the council has recently approved a Corporate Improvement Plan to increase and expand the level of change management through improved working practices, refocused corporate training and self evaluation. It is intended that this will play a significant role in the delivery of the projected £30 million of savings required over the period 2010/11 to 2013/14.

19. The LAN has planned scrutiny activity to consider significant risk areas incorporating some collaborative working between the scrutiny bodies. A summary of planned scrutiny activity over the three year period 2010-2013 - including specific scrutiny work identified for Dundee City Council, ongoing local baseline activity and baseline activity being undertaken as part of national scrutiny programmes - is presented in the table below.

Summary of planned scrutiny activity 2010/13	
Specific work	<p>Specific scrutiny exercises to be undertaken in response to identified risks will include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2010/11 – SHR verifying progress against housing improvement plan. • 2010/11 – HMIE Protection of Children and Young People – follow-up. • 2010/11 – HMIE request an update report on attainment levels and on the impact of strategies to support those requiring More Chances More Choices. • 2010/11 – Initial Scrutiny Level Assessment by SWIA, which will be used to inform the scrutiny plan for 2011/2012. • 2010/11 – 2012/13 – annual review of progress of implementation and impact of change programme and BV improvement plan by Audit Scotland. • 2011/12 – SHR follow-up of housing management and asset management.
Ongoing work	<p>Baseline scrutiny activity being undertaken locally will include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • inspection of education and care establishments by the Care Commission and HMIE. • monitoring of performance and risk through link inspector contact by HMIE and SWIA. • annual audit of accounts, governance and accountability, and financial position by Audit Scotland. • ongoing monitoring of emerging risks to inform future risks assessment and scrutiny plans by all members of the LAN.
National work	<p>Baseline scrutiny activity being undertaken as part of national scrutiny programmes targeted at priority risk areas will include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 2010/11 – review of council update on progress on meeting Scottish Housing Quality Standard by SHR. • 2010/11 – 2011/12 – annual reviews of fostering and adoption services by the Care Commission. • 2011/12 - joint inspection of services to protect children and young people (CP2).

20. The council has recently been subject to reviews by Audit Scotland (BV2), HMIE and the SHR. This has helped to identify any specific areas of concern and the council is working to implement improvement plans to address these. In 2010/11 corporate level scrutiny will include SHR follow-up work in Housing and Asset Management, a joint interim follow through inspection of services to protect children led by HMIE, and a SWIA initial scrutiny level assessment (ISLA). The annual audit will monitor the council's development of its corporate improvement plans and the implementation of the key aspects of these highlighted in the recent BV2 pathfinder audit, assessing their overall impact over the next three years.
21. Collaborative working will be undertaken in 2011/12 linking the outcomes from SWIA's ISLA, HMIE's Child Protection (CP2) and the Care Commission's Fostering and Adoption inspections.
22. National risk priorities have been identified by the Scottish Government and these are reflected in the shared risk assessments for all councils. Planned scrutiny work will address the national scrutiny priorities as follows:
 - Baseline service inspection programmes will examine the effectiveness of arrangements for protection, welfare and access to opportunities for vulnerable groups. These will be augmented by targeted follow-up of concerns previously identified in child protection and housing.
 - Local auditor follow-up work will examine the progress and impact of improvement actions arising from the recent BV2 audit intended to assist the council in securing best value and ensuring public money is being spent properly. Baseline annual audit activity will also keep the stewardship, propriety and governance of public resources under review.
 - The impact of the recession and the associated pressure on the council's finances will be kept under review through the baseline annual audit and will inform future LAN considerations.

3. The council's context

Dundee is Scotland's fourth largest city. The area has a declining population and high levels of deprivation and health and social inequality. Unemployment is above the national average and rising. The city is transforming itself into a knowledge based economy. However the ultimate impact of the recession on the city's transformation is unclear.

23. Dundee is the smallest council area in Scotland, with the city boundaries covering only 26 square miles. This helps to give council officers and members a strong sense of identity and purpose.
24. Dundee is Scotland's fourth largest city with 142,000 people living there, but there are around 300,000 people within a 30-minute drive, including 20,000 who commute into the city to work. Compared to the Scottish average there are more people aged 15 - 29 living in the city. Population projections indicate that the population, although currently stable, will decrease by 9.2 per cent by 2031. The increase in people of pensionable age is projected to be significantly less than the Scottish average. At the same time, the populations of children and people of working age are projected to decrease by a greater proportion than the Scottish average.
25. Dundee faces significant challenges of deprivation and health and social inequality. Over the past three decades, with the loss of its traditional manufacturing industries, the economy of Dundee has largely been in decline. Unemployment amongst the working age population is well above the Scottish average, and more than one in five are claiming benefits. Almost one in three of its population live in areas of high deprivation, the third highest proportion in Scotland.
26. Life expectancy in the most deprived areas of Dundee is around ten years below the national average, and the city has high levels of alcohol-related deaths, problematic drug users, teenage pregnancies, and mothers smoking in pregnancy. Educational attainment has been amongst the lowest in Scotland.
27. Compared with Scotland on average, renting from a social or a private landlord is more prevalent in Dundee. By contrast home ownership is less common. Just over half (53.62 per cent) of the population own their property, while 34.68 per cent rent from a social landlord (the council, a housing association or other registered social landlord) and just under 12 per cent rent from a private landlord. Housing prices are lower in Dundee than the Scottish average
28. Car ownership is less prevalent in Dundee than Scotland as a whole. Fifty-three per cent of households in Dundee have access to at least one car, compared to 70 per cent in Scotland. The majority (67 per cent) of people travel to work by car (two per cent below the Scottish average). In Dundee, 8.9 per cent of driver journeys were delayed due to traffic congestion, lower than the Scottish average of 12.82 per cent.
29. Dundee is undergoing significant change in the face of these issues. It is transforming itself into a knowledge-based economy, with growth in further education and in science, technology and retail

employment. The physical condition of key parts of the city has been much improved and the Waterfront redevelopment is also aiming to transform the image of the city.

30. The city faces further challenges in the short to medium term. The current recession in the UK economy poses a threat to the economic momentum of the city, increasing risk of deepening social and health inequalities. It will also lead to a reduction in public sector resources.
31. Internally, the council is also undergoing a significant transition in its leadership. After many years of a Labour and Liberal Democrat administration, a minority SNP administration took power in April 2009. In October 2009, a new chief executive was appointed following the retirement of the previous post holder, who had been in the role since the council was created in 1995.
32. Following the May 2007 elections there was a streamlining of the council's committee structure reducing the number of committees from 13 to seven. All members continue to serve on all committees.
33. In 2008/09 the council spent approximately £641 million on the provision of public services, £595 million on revenue costs and the remainder on capital projects. Income for the year from central government, local taxation and other sources amounted to £508 million. The council has adopted a prudent approach to managing its finances in the past and there is no history of overspends.
34. The general fund decreased by £1.1 million during the year to a balance of £7.4 million which equates to 1.8 per cent of the council's annual net operating expenditure. Of this balance £4.3 million is unallocated. This exceeds the minimum level of £2.1 million agreed by the council in February 2008 to cope with unforeseen events. A revenue budget monitoring report presented to the Policy and Resources Committee in March 2010 projected an overspend of £168,000 for 2009/10.

Self-evaluation

The council's approach to self-evaluation remains at a relatively early stage of maturity. It is not yet able to present a coherent picture of how well it is delivering overall on its strategic objectives or clearly articulate the impact the council and its partners are having in priority outcome areas. It reviews the way it does things and there is some evidence these reviews lead to proposals for change but systematic option appraisal is not well embedded.

35. The council considers the way it does things using a wide range of review processes. These have included best value service reviews, reviews arising from the application of the Improvement Service's efficiency diagnostic and "lean service" process reviews. Further review activity is incorporated into the council's corporate plan. There is evidence that these reviews lead to proposals for change to the way things are done but systematic option appraisal is not well embedded. The number of separate reviews also suggests that scrutiny activity is not well coordinated.
36. The council has also made use of the European Foundation Quality Model (EFQM) since 1998 to support some of its self-evaluation activity. All departments have carried out EFQM self-assessments and in some areas application of the model is well developed. The Social Work department recently

received an Excellence (bronze) award from EFQM. EFQM has also been used at corporate level, most recently in 2007 as part of the process for the developing the Council Plan. There is evidence that this has helped identify areas for improvement.

37. The first Best Value report on Dundee City Council highlighted elected member scrutiny and a lack of challenge as areas for improvement. The BV2 report highlighted that much of the successful improvement activity in recent years had been in response to external stimulus and that the critical findings of the recent SHR and HMIE inspections had come as a surprise to elected members. The report concluded that insufficient progress had been made in improving elected member scrutiny and challenge.
38. The council also operates an online performance monitoring database that it uses to report on performance at a number of levels. The system is now well established, and the council has made a step change in improving its performance management arrangements.

4. Delivering outcomes for communities

The council and its partners are making progress against many of their objectives for the city. There have been significant reductions in crime levels and progress has been made across a wide range of measures, covering the local economy, wellbeing and education. There is some uncertainty about the impact of the recession on targets and there are still gaps in the available monitoring information. The performance of council services has risen overall during a period of a modest real terms rise in the resources applied each year. Although, not all key services have been performing well, the council is making progress in implementing improvement plans in relation to child protection and housing.

Council planning and approach

39. The council and its partners have established a clear vision for Dundee. Their key objectives reflect the underlying issues that need to be addressed in the city and are reflected in the themes and 11 desired outcomes within Dundee Partnership’s current Single Outcome Agreement (SOA), summarised in below. The main challenges relate to tackling the interwoven issues of unemployment, social inequality, deprivation and health.

Dundee Partnership: Strategic themes and outcomes	
Learning and culture	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Our people will be better educated and skilled within a knowledge economy renowned for research, innovation and culture.
Children and young people	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Our children will be safe, nurtured, healthy, achieving, active, respected, responsible and included.
Health and wellbeing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Our people will experience fewer health inequalities • Our people will have improved physical and mental well being • Our people will receive effective care when they need it.
Work and enterprise	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dundee will be a regional centre with better job opportunities and increased employability for our people.
Community safety	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Our communities will be safe and feel safe.
Building stronger communities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Our people will experience fewer social inequalities • Our people will live in stable, attractive and popular neighbourhoods • Our people will have high quality and accessible local services and facilities.
Dundee environment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dundee will have a sustainable environment and environmental justice.

40. The aims set out in the SOA are consistent with those previously agreed between partners. They have agreed that it will be the key strategic document that underpins each of their own plans. It is focused on a manageable and meaningful number of high-level outcomes and supporting indicators, clearly linked to the Scottish Government’s strategic objectives and national outcomes, and to the strategic objectives in the existing Council Plan.

41. The links between the SOA and the council's current operational plans are less clear. The council has recognised the need to establish a clearer connection between service plans and the themes of the SOA, community plan, Council Plan and other key strategies. Work is underway to address this to ensure that the council's activity supports delivery of the desired outcomes. Thematic SOA delivery plans are currently being developed to more clearly identify who is doing what, and to set out intermediate outcomes and performance measures as a basis for monitoring progress. Partners have recognised the need to address gaps in the information currently available to help assess progress, for example in measuring the reduction in inequalities.

Strategic priorities

42. In assessing whether Dundee City Council is delivering outcomes for its communities, we considered relevant performance measures from a number of key sources including: SOA performance reports, statutory performance indicators (SPIs), key performance indicators and other inspection/audit reports. The detail of our evaluation is contained in Appendix 1.

Work and enterprise

43. There is good evidence that, in recent years the council and its partners have made progress in delivering this outcome with significant success in reducing unemployment between 2006 and 2008. The economic recession, however, has threatened this progress with unemployment rising to 5.8 per cent (January 2010) from 3.9 per cent (December 2008). The full impact of the recession on the Dundee economy is unclear at present and there is uncertainty as to whether the actions taken by the council and its partners will be sufficient to deliver the desired outcomes. We will continue to monitor the economic data relating to this objective.

Learning and culture

44. Progress on this outcome is mixed. Good progress has been made towards improving the education and skills of people in Dundee and developing a 'knowledge economy'. Also, the impact of community learning services in Dundee and the outcomes achieved by participants have been assessed by HMIE as very good overall, with some projects nationally-recognised as models of good practice.
45. Attainment levels in secondary schools have improved by more than the national average, although they remain below the Scottish average. The council has not used data on schools to demonstrate whether it is making progress in closing the gap in attainment levels between the city average and pupils coming from the most deprived areas. HMIE has expressed concern as to the degree of impact of More Choices More Chances (MCMC) strategies on positive destination figures. HMIE will review attainment levels and positive destination data annually.

Children and young people

46. The children and young peoples' services provided by the council have been an area of particular concern. The council and its partners in health and police were the subject of a highly critical joint inspection of services to protect children by HMIE in June 2009, with an early follow-up report published in March 2010. An improvement plan has been agreed and the council has made significant changes to its systems and processes. However, it is too early to determine the impact of these changes on service users.
47. The council is experiencing increasing difficulty in meeting the needs of looked after and fostered children, and is taking steps to reduce the number of children in expensive out of area placements; some children are experiencing significant delays while waiting for permanent new families.

Health and well being

48. There is some evidence that the health of the Dundee population is improving. Deaths from coronary heart disease, hospital admissions related to alcohol, and child obesity have reduced. In other areas, however, there is uncertainty as to whether the council and its partners are achieving their objectives, in part due to the long term nature of these; smoking, children's dental health and substance abuse are areas where improvement is required. In addition, the council lacks adequate monitoring information to demonstrate that it is improving health or tackling health inequalities. The LAN will monitor progress against outcomes.

Community safety

49. Overall satisfactory progress is reported by the council and its partners, with crime levels in Dundee at their lowest for a decade. In many cases, ambitious targets set for 2010/11 have already been met. No significant risks have been identified in this area.

Building stronger communities

50. There is good evidence of progress in improving the quality and condition of the built environment and the city's infrastructure. There have been significant improvements to the city centre and facilities available across the city, including schools, arts venues and community facilities. There is, however, little clear evidence to show that the council and its partners are making any significant progress on reducing social inequality. From the information that is currently available, the Dundee Partnership has not yet been able to reduce the proportion of the population living in the 15 per cent most deprived Scottish datazones. Similarly, the difference in average incomes between the deprived areas and the rest of the city has increased. The LAN will monitor progress against outcomes.

Dundee environment

51. There is insufficient evidence to properly assess the overall progress of the council and its partners in improving the city's sustainable environment. Progress measures tend to focus on the completion of projects rather than providing an assessment of impact. However, the evidence that is available

suggests that the council is making some progress, in particular in recycling where current projections are that the Council has achieved its 40 per cent target for 2009/10. The LAN will monitor progress against outcomes.

Services

52. The BV 2 Pathfinder audit identified that, within the context of the city and its relatively high levels of deprivation, many council services are performing well. Available performance measures show general improvement in the services provided to the public, although this is not consistent across the organisation.
53. **Education service** - Overall the Education Service is steadily improving. The management team and overall service structure are relatively new and the benefits of these changes are beginning to be realised. Although there are positive signs of improvement, attainment and attendance levels remain below national averages. A significant increase in attainment levels to bring them more in line with national levels is a challenge which will take time. A degree of uncertainty exists due to the lack of evidence of sustained and continuous improvement in some aspects of the service.
54. HMIE will continue with the planned programme of inspection of schools and pre-school establishments (sometimes jointly with the Care Commission). HMIE completed its planned follow-through inspection of Services to Protect Children and Young People in March 2010. The evaluations from these inspections will contribute to the National Performance Framework. This may also result in some follow-through inspection activity. HMIE will inspect Community Learning and Development concurrently with any non-denominational secondary school inspection. HMIE will also be involved in scrutiny activity as a result of Ministerial requests and other statutory obligations. The District Inspector (DI) will continue to support and challenge Education Services regularly and as appropriate.
55. **Social Work service** - In 2007 SWIA assessed the Social Work service as having a number of 'very strong aspects' to the delivery of Social Work services and some areas for improvement. The Care Commission has identified important strengths in council run care homes for older people with grades of good and very good being achieved across the service. These services are also highly rated by the residents. The Care Commission has also reported favourably in respect of council run residential childcare units. SWIA has recommended that the department develop a commissioning strategy for its community care and children's services and continues to monitor the progress of its implementation.
56. **Housing** - The Scottish Housing Regulator's 2009 inspection raised significant concerns about the council's housing services. Asset management and repairs and housing management were assessed as "poor". In addition to addressing the findings of the SHR the council still has a considerable amount to do to ensure that its housing stock meets the SHQ standard by the 2015 target date. Although the pace of improvement has shown an increase only 23 per cent of existing stock meets the required standard. An improvement plan has been agreed with the SHR who will review the

council's progress against this in September 2010. This will inform follow-up work which is scheduled for September 2011.

57. **Corporate Services** - The council has in the past managed its finances prudently with a strong emphasis on the annual budget and controlling expenditure within individual funding streams. There is no history of overspends and uncommitted general fund reserves are currently above the target levels. However, there are some underlying pressures in the recurring budget that the council will have to manage in future years alongside the significant constraints on public expenditure in the medium term.
58. The existing approach to resource management and planning is unlikely to be effective moving forward. The council and its partners will need to take a more strategic approach to resource allocation, being more flexible in the way individual funding streams are applied. The Corporate Improvement Plan approved by Council on 26 April includes a number of initiatives aimed at addressing this.
59. **Environmental/Regulatory Services** - The council's Environmental/Regulatory services are generally performing well with good performances noted in noise complaints food hygiene inspections. There are, however, some areas where performance could improve.
60. **Cultural Services** - There are no significant risks identified for the Cultural Services division. The Leisure and Community Learning departments provide valuable opportunities for the people of Dundee to participate in sporting and cultural activities. Some CLD projects have been nationally recognised as models of good practice.
61. **Roads and Street Lighting** - The Roads and Street Lighting service is generally performing well. The council is highly ranked for the low percentage of its roads in need of maintenance and its traffic light repairs. SPIs, however, show that in some areas, eg carriageway, traffic light and street light repair performance is showing signs of decline.

Implications for scrutiny activity

62. In Social Work and Housing the relevant inspectorates will follow-up the council's progress in addressing improvement areas previously reported. This scrutiny activity will be designed to establish recent performance and the impact of actions that the council has taken. It will be focused on agreed improvement actions and will seek to confirm the council's own assessment of its progress:
 - In 2010 a joint interim follow through inspection of services to protect children led by HMIE to assess progress against the main points for action raised in their report of an inspection published in June 2009.
 - In 2010/11 the council will submit a self assessment of the action taken following the agreement of the SHR inspection improvement plan in 2009 and its impact on customers. The findings from this will inform future follow-up work by the SHR in 2011/12.

- SWIA will undertake an initial scrutiny level assessment (ISLA) in 2010/11 which will help to determine the nature and focus of scrutiny activity they and the LAN members will undertake in following years.
63. In response to a ministerial request to carry out a further 3 year programme of joint inspection of services to protect children between 2009 and 2012, the council and its partners in health and police will be subject to a joint inspection of services to protect children in 2012. The outcomes from the follow through inspection in 2010 will help to determine the scope of this work. It is anticipated that it will be coordinated with the Care Commission's reviews of fostering and adoption services, with an integrated approach being piloted in another council shortly. We would also anticipate the any scrutiny SWIA identifies as a result of completing the ISLA being coordinated with this work to avoid any duplication and minimise the impact on the council and its partners.
64. The LAN will continue to review outcome and performance information as it emerges, discussing relevant aspects of this with the council on an ongoing basis. This will include regular HMIE District Inspector meetings, ongoing liaison with link inspectors and other regular contact with SWIA, the Care Commission and Audit Scotland. Such discussions will also cover any corporate or partnership issues emerging from establishment/unit inspections. Any emerging issues or risks will be reflected in future risk assessments, and may lead to further scrutiny work where these are considered significant.

5. Corporate assessment

The council and its partners have a clear and ambitious vision for tackling the issues facing the city. There are strong relationships amongst partner organisations in Dundee and they are making progress against many of their objectives. However, partnership working at a strategic level requires to be strengthened. The council is generally aware of where it needs to improve and has made improvements in some areas. However, in other areas the pace of change has been too slow. Some of the council's corporate arrangements, in particular those for elected member scrutiny and risk management are under-developed and there is concern about the council's capacity to drive through significant improvement, service development and change.

65. In determining the corporate assessment for Dundee City Council, we considered the corporate performance and arrangements in place. The detail of our evaluation is contained in Appendix 2.
66. The council and its partners have a clear and ambitious vision for the area, based on a sound approach to community engagement and a good understanding of the needs and concerns of local people.
67. There are strong relationships amongst partner organisations in Dundee, with many examples of effective joint working on projects having a positive impact on the quality of the services being delivered. There have been problems in more complex operational areas, where roles and responsibilities are confused. Partnership working at a strategic level requires to be strengthened. The introduction of the SOA has helped the partners to begin to address this.
68. The council is generally aware of where it needs to improve its ways of working and has implemented some improvements. However, much of the improvement that has been made to ways of working has been in response to external pressure (such as inspection). In some important areas where the council has identified a longstanding need to improve its arrangements there has been insufficient commitment or capacity and the pace of change has been too slow.
69. The council has a sound record of working with local communities and taking a systematic approach to defining their needs. Over 80 per cent of local plans agreed through Local Community Planning Partnerships (LCPP) have been delivered. The LCPPs are viewed positively by those involved.
70. The council has adopted a prudent, incremental approach to improvement, underpinned by strong central control of resources and high levels of managerial accountability. This has been effective in driving up performance levels and ensuring that spending was tightly controlled. With the financial challenges the council faces in coming years from reduced funding the current approach is unlikely to deliver the scale of change required. The council needs to do more to ensure that its resources are aligned with its priorities and, with its partners, will require to take a more strategic approach to resource allocation, being more flexible in the way individual funding streams are applied.
71. Asset Management Plans have been produced for a number of services, but these are disjointed and reactive. Human resources are managed well at an operational level, staff are generally well

motivated and committed with high levels of morale but the council's corporate HR strategy is under developed and slow progress is being made towards improving it. The council has made slow progress in transforming its procurement arrangements and needs to increase the pace of change.

72. The council has many of the key elements in place to ensure good governance and accountability. However, elected member scrutiny of decision making and performance needs to improve. Elected members need to make a bigger contribution to the leadership of the council and its partnerships over a range of important areas and need to be better supported by officers to do so. Corporate risk management processes are under-developed and not yet fully embedded. Recent inspectorate activity has indicated that members and officers are not risk aware. Members are not, however, sufficiently involved in risk management.
73. The council has made relatively slow progress in eliminating discrimination and promoting equalities. Few managers and no elected members have received formal race equality training and the council has limited evidence to demonstrate that it delivers equalities more widely in its services.
74. The council also needs to do more to embed sustainable delivery of services and outcomes and to ensure that sustainability is scrutinised by members and officers.

Implications for scrutiny activity

75. An Audit of Best Value and Community Planning (BV2) was undertaken by Audit Scotland in 2009, to establish the council and its partner's overall performance in addressing their strategic priorities and improving services. This considered the effectiveness of the council's management arrangements and partnership working. The audit focused on how well the council has driven improvement in the use of public resources in the very challenging period ahead and how well placed it is to further improve at this point. The findings of that audit have been considered in determining the scrutiny activity for 2010/2013.
76. Key areas of uncertainty will be explored through the annual audit, including:
 - The council's progress in implementing improvement actions to address the key issues raised in the BV2 audit (see table below), and measuring their impact.
 - The management of the council's overall financial position in the face of financial constraints and increased demand for services. In particular the council's approach to identifying and achieving efficiencies and savings.

Best Value 2 : Improvement actions	
The council	<p><i>The council needs to :</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • continue to implement improvement actions agreed following the recent inspection of housing. • put in place an effective approach to elected member scrutiny of decision-making and performance. • ensure that it is more open and transparent, with better discussion of key issues in public meetings. • implement a more coordinated approach to improvement and efficiency in order to create more corporate capacity for improvement and change, including. • target efforts better and implement more robust planning and monitoring of progress, implementation and impact. • make greater and more robust use of benchmarking, cost comparison and option appraisal considering the scope for alternative approaches and more joint working. • strengthen corporate working and internal partnerships, building more collaborative working and ensuring learning and best practice are identified and shared more widely. • improve its strategic management of resources, improving longer term financial planning and developing more active planning for the use of assets and people. • increase ownership and improve leadership in promoting equalities; engage more effectively with equalities groups. Develop a more effective approach to Equalities Impact Assessment and better monitoring of impact.
Elected Members	<p><i>Elected Members need to:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • increase their contribution and ownership of key subjects – leading community planning at a strategic level, policy development, risk management, efficiency and improvement. Council officers need to provide better support to enable members to do this.
The council and its partners	<p><i>With its partners, the council should:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • continue to implement improvement actions to ensure effective services to protect children. • establish shared and clearly understood priorities for spending that reflect the anticipated reduction in available resources in a collaborative manner that brings together the political choices of local elected members and the nationally led policies and priorities of other public sector partners. • ensure that meetings at all levels of the partnership are better focused on coordinating partnership activity, deciding on priorities and who does what and monitoring progress and impact. • review partnership structures to ensure that the respective roles and responsibilities of different groups are clear, minimising overlap. • ensure that partnership aims are specified at an appropriate level and are supported by relevant indicators and measures of impact and progress.

6. Conclusion

Summary of planned scrutiny activity

77. The appendices to this plan show a summary of the evidence we considered and the overall risk assessments made by the LAN on the outcome, service and corporate risk assessments. They show what scrutiny response the LAN has decided is appropriate in each area. The shared risk assessment process is designed to ensure the level of scrutiny activity is proportionate, based on the assessed risks.
78. These results are then reflected in the Assurance and Improvement Plan at Appendix 3 which sets out the basis of our scrutiny risk assessment and the planned scrutiny activity for Dundee City Council for the period from April 2010 to March 2013. The plan covers a three year rolling period and includes all scrutiny activity at corporate and service level.
79. National risk priorities have been identified by the Scottish Government and these are reflected in national scrutiny priorities which have been considered in the shared risk assessments for all councils. The national scrutiny priorities are:
- **Protection, welfare and access to opportunities for: children, adults in need of support and protection, and older people.** This priority will be addressed through baseline service inspection programmes – including a joint inspection of services to protect children, scrutiny activity by SWIA and Care Commission fostering and adoption inspections - HMIE and SHR's follow-ups of progress against improvement plans.
 - **Assuring public money is being used properly.** This priority will be addressed through the follow-up of the BV2 audit, which will examine the council's progress towards the implementation of agreed improvement actions and their impact. Baseline annual audit activity will also keep the stewardship, propriety and governance of public funds under review.
 - **The impact of the recession.** This priority and the associated pressure on the council's finances will be kept under review through the baseline annual audit.
80. On-going progress updates of the risks identified within this report by the appropriate scrutiny body will inform future risk assessments and the levels of scrutiny activity.

Appendix 1 – Risk assessment

Performance assessment: Dundee City Council			
Outcomes	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
<p>Work & enterprise</p> <p>Dundee will be a regional centre with better job opportunities and increased employability for our people.</p> <p>(NO1,NO2,NO3)</p>	<p>Area of uncertainty</p>	<p><i>There is evidence that the council has been making progress in recent years, however, the recession has had a significant impact which must be managed now and in the years to come.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Progress was evidenced through reductions in unemployment and the numbers claiming workless benefits and increases in new business start ups and employment in the knowledge, financial retail and leisure services sectors. • The number unemployed increased in 2008/09 and is above the national average. 	<p>No specific scrutiny work planned.</p>
<p>Learning & culture</p> <p>Our people will be better educated and skilled within a knowledge economy renowned for research, innovation and culture.</p> <p>(NO1,NO2,NO3, NO4,NO5,NO7, NO13)</p>	<p>No significant risks identified</p>	<p><i>Good progress has been made towards improving the education and skills of people in Dundee and in developing a knowledge economy. However attainment levels are still considerably below the national average and need to continue to improve.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The numbers employed in the city's education and research sector have increased over the past 2 years and are above target. • 2006 HMIE inspection assessed the impact of learning services in Dundee and the outcomes achieved by participants as very good. • The numbers of adults attending classes to improve literacy and numeracy have increased by over 13%. • The proportion of young people going on to further education or training is now well above the national average. 	<p>No specific scrutiny work planned.</p>
	<p>Area of uncertainty</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Educational attainment levels are improving but remain well below the national average. • There have been concerns as to the degree of impact More Choices More Chances (MCMC) strategies have had on numbers moving on to positive destinations. The council has introduced a number of initiatives to 	<p>HMIE will request update reports on attainment and MCMC from the Director of Education in 2010/11.</p>

Performance assessment: Dundee City Council			
Outcomes	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
		<p>address these concerns and some improvement has been achieved.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The council has not used data on schools to indicate whether it is making progress in closing the gap in attainment levels between the city average and pupils coming from the most deprived areas. 	
<p>Children & young people</p> <p>Our children will be safe, nurtured, healthy achieving, active, respected, responsible and included.</p> <p>(NO2,NO3, NO4,NO5,NO6, NO7, NO8,NO9, NO15)</p>	<p>Area of uncertainty</p>	<p><i>Child protection has been an area of specific concern. Following an HMIE inspection an improvement plan has been implemented but it is too early to assess the impact of the changes introduced.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The numbers of children looked after or fostered are rising with some children experiencing significant delays while waiting for permanent new families. The council is seeking to reduce the numbers of children in expensive out-of-area residential placements. Most pupils with ASN are successfully integrated into mainstream education. Very negative CP inspection in June 2009. Lack of confidence that all children at risk from harm, abuse or neglect are identified and receive appropriate help and support. The number of young people not going on to positive destinations has risen and is still well above the national average. The council is working to target those currently in negative destinations. The Social Work service is seeking to implement an improvement plan for child protection against a significant backcloth of financial pressure. 	<p>HMIE Joint Inspection of services to protect children in 2012.</p> <p>SWIA will carry out an initial scrutiny level assessment (desk based risk assessment) in 2010. The link inspector will continue to support self evaluation undertaken by the Council.</p>
<p>Health & well being</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Our people will experience fewer health inequalities. Our people will have improved physical 	<p>No significant risks identified</p>	<p><i>There is some evidence that the health of the Dundee population is improving. However, further improvements are necessary to support the achievement of outcomes.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improvements have been recognised in the levels of coronary heart disease, alcohol related hospital admissions and childhood obesity.. All schools are health promoting. 	<p>No specific scrutiny work planned.</p>

Performance assessment: Dundee City Council			
Outcomes	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
<p>and mental wellbeing.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Our people will receive effective care when they need it. <p>(NO2,NO3, NO4,NO5,NO6, NO7, NO8,NO9, NO12, NO15)</p>	Area of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Monitoring information for the various outcome aims is incomplete. To some extent this is due to the long-term nature of some of these. The proportion of the population who smoke has increased over the last two years and is unlikely to meet the 2010 target of 22%. Services to support substance misusers and their dependents are under developed and lack prioritisation. Concern regarding the quality of commissioned care home services for older people. 	
<p>Community safety</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Our communities will be safe and feel safe. <p>(NO9, NO11)</p>	No significant risks identified	<p><i>The council is moving in the right direction and there is evidence that good progress has been made towards this outcome.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recorded crime levels in Dundee are at their lowest for a decade and customer satisfaction with the police service in Dundee is well above the national average. The number of people killed or seriously injured in road traffic accidents. The target for reduction by 2010/11 was surpassed in 2008/09. Chief officers in Dundee City Council, NHS Tayside and Tayside Police have established a Chief Officers Group with a joint responsibility for public protection. This has provided for clearer joint accountability and a stronger strategic focus on protecting the public. 	No specific scrutiny work planned.
<p>Building stronger communities</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Our people will experience fewer social inequalities. Our people will live in stable, popular and attractive communities. 	No significant risks identified	<p><i>There is good evidence of progress in improving the quality and condition of the built environment and the city's infrastructure. However, there is little clear evidence to show that the council and its partners are making any significant progress on reducing social inequality.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proportion of public buildings suitable and accessible to disabled people is amongst the highest in Scotland. Residents' surveys show increased satisfaction with access to and quality of local services and facilities. 	No specific scrutiny work planned.

Performance assessment: Dundee City Council			
Outcomes	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Our people will have high quality and accessible local services and facilities. (NO2,NO3, NO4,NO5,NO6, NO7, NO8,NO9, NO10, NO11, NO12, NO13, NO14, NO15).		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The facilities provided by the Leisure and Communities department have a positive impact on the community, helping adults and young people to develop skills through engaging in a wide range of leisure, cultural and community activities. The council is promoting a 'broadband economy' , using communication technology to support economic and social development. 	
	Area of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Uncertainty as to whether the council is reducing social inequality The proportion of the population living in the most deprived Scottish datazones increased slightly to 28.4% in 2009. The difference in average incomes between the deprived areas and the rest of the city has increased from 17.3% to 18.8% against the Council's target to reduce this to 15%. 	Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress through follow-up to assess implementation and impact of BV2 improvement actions.
Dundee environment <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Dundee will have a sustainable environment. (NO12, NO14)	No significant risks identified	<p><i>There is insufficient evidence to properly assess the overall progress of the council and its partners in improving the city's sustainable environment. However, the available evidence suggests that the council is making some progress.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recycling rates have steadily increased to 35.6% in 2008/09. This is the highest rate amongst the four Scottish city councils. A waste-to energy plant has helped to more than halve the amount of waste that is sent to landfill. The overall cleanliness of the city, as measured by the LEAMS index has steadily improved. The number of green flags, awarded for parks, and blue flags, for beaches, has increased in line with targets. 	No specific scrutiny work planned.
	Area of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Progress measures tend to focus on the completion of projects rather than providing an assessment of impact. Evidence suggests that the air quality in the city has deteriorated. 	No specific scrutiny work planned

Performance assessment: Dundee City Council			
Council services	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
Education	No significant risks identified	<p><i>Early Years</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Early years centres are a strength. <p><i>Primary</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Primary school inspection results show performance that is 'good' overall rather than 'very good'. All inspections over the last two sessions have been positive in respect of Scotland Performs and improvements in performance were good or better in all cases. • The percentage of primary schools in which the ratio of pupils to available places is between 81-100% has declined from 17.5% in 2006/07 to 10.8% in 2008/09 • Exclusion rates for primary schools fell slightly in 2009 but are still more than double the national average and the highest in Scotland. • Attainment in reading, writing and mathematics rose between 2003 and 2008. However attainment in writing still requires improvement. <p><i>Overall</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Follow-up inspection of council's education service in 2009 found that significant improvements had been achieved in a number of areas. • Clear corporate focus on raising attainment. • Promotion of the arts is a key strength. • The appointment of a new Director of Education and a new Head of Secondary Education and a review of the overall management structure are still relatively recent occurrences. The full impact and benefits of these changes are beginning to be realised. • The service plan mirrors the council's corporate plan. The ten themes 	No specific scrutiny work planned

Performance assessment: Dundee City Council			
Council services	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
		<p>link to priorities in the annual improvement plan and the SOA outcomes.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Teacher-pupil ratios are more generous than the national average in both primary and secondary sectors. 	
	Area of uncertainty	<p><i>Overall</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Absence figures are still above those of comparators. <p><i>Secondary</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Attainment levels have increased by more than the national average but remain considerably below the national average. Results across all key measures at S4 showed a small but significant increase in 2009, with a subsequent rise in the three year average for mathematics and English at level 3. Results at S5 in 2009 declined overall and are below the national average. Significantly, S6 results across all key measures showed an increase in 2009 and the three year averages showed an improving figure. Results are still below the national and comparator averages. The proportion of young people going on to education or training is now well above the national and comparator authority averages. However, the number of young people not going on to positive destinations rose in 2009 to 18%, a figure well above the national average. The proportion of young people leaving school with recognised qualifications has improved marginally. Performance of the lowest performing 20% of young people has improved significantly. Exclusion figures are decreasing but are still high in comparison with national figures. 	<p>HMIE will request update reports on attainment and MCMC from the Director of Education in 2010/11.</p>

Performance assessment: Dundee City Council			
Council services	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
Social work	No significant risks identified	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2007 inspection of Social Work services identified a number of 'very strong aspects' of the delivery of social work services and some areas for improvement. 2008/09 performance data shows that the council performs well in number of areas. All council run care homes for older people are now rated good or very good and there are high levels of user satisfaction. The performance of Residential Childcare Units is rated as very good. Although still below the target of 30% the balance of social work expenditure on home care has increased to 28%. This is helping to address poor waiting times for home care. There is a positive relationship between Social Work Department's Contracts team in inspection activity for private and voluntary sector care homes for older people. Moderate progress is being made in developing a commissioning strategy for its community care and children's services. 	SWIA will carry out an initial scrutiny level assessment during 2010. which will include the areas of uncertainty identified below. The link inspector will continue to support self evaluation undertaken by the council.
	Area of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Within Children's Secure and Close Support Units there are issues relating to the deployment of management and staff, and uncertainty over funding for educational service at secure accommodation. Inspection of Child protection services in 2009 raised significant concerns and made a number of critical key findings. There are concerns regarding the assessment framework used by the criminal justice service. This is likely, however, to be replaced in the next 18 months as a result of national policy initiatives. The council is still poor in submitting social background reports to the children's reporter on time, although performance has improved over the last year. 	<p>HMIE joint follow-through inspection of services to protect children in November 2010 will evaluate progress made by the council and its partners against the main points for action since June 2009.</p> <p>HMIE Joint Inspection of services to protect children in 2012.</p>

Performance assessment: Dundee City Council			
Council services	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
Housing	Area of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A 2009 inspection raised significant concerns about the council's housing services. Housing and asset management were both assessed as poor. An improvement plan has been agreed with the SHR. • More than 75% of the council's housing stock still falls short of the SHQS standard. • Concerns about the performance of the housing service continue to be reflected in current performance data. 	<p>SHR will review progress towards implementation and impact of agreed improvement plan from 2009 inspection during 2010/11.</p> <p>Follow-up from this to be undertaken in 2011/12.</p>
Corporate services	Area of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The existing approach to resource management and planning is unlikely to be effective moving forward. • There are some underlying pressures in the recurring budget that the council will have to manage in future years alongside the significant constraints on public expenditure in the medium term. • The council has recognised the need to create greater management capacity to identify and deliver the scale of change required and is introducing a Corporate Improvement Plan to address this. • Five out of the six corporate services SPIs are in the bottom quartile. The council tax collection rate has improved over the medium term. However, the council has the second lowest level of Council Tax collected in year. 	<p>Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress through follow-up to assess implementation and impact of BV2 improvement actions.</p>
Environmental services/ regulatory services	No significant risks identified	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Net cost of refuse collection is in the top quartile. • There is good joint working with the council's Food and Health and Safety Team in joint regulatory activity. • Performance in dealing with noise complaints is good. • Food hygiene inspections are highly ranked. 	<p>No specific scrutiny work planned.</p>

Performance assessment: Dundee City Council			
Council services	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
	Area of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ranked 25th for the percentage of derelict land (Countryside management). Middling performance for most aspects of waste management. Planning performance is average and declining. 	No specific scrutiny work planned.
Cultural services	No significant risks identified	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Leisure Services and CLD staff provide valued opportunities for the people of Dundee to participate in sporting and cultural activities. A number of projects target disadvantaged areas and some CLD projects have been nationally recognised as models of good practice. The number of attendances per 1,000 population for sports and leisure facilities excluding pools is improving. However, the proportion using pools has declined by almost 10% since 2006/07. The use of libraries and learning centre/access points both feature in the top quartile. However, SPIs show that the number of additions per 1,000 population is declining across all categories. The percentage of the population that borrows from libraries is ranked 28th and is declining. 	No specific scrutiny work planned.
Roads and street lighting	Area of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The council is ranked 4th overall for the overall percentage of the road network that should be considered for maintenance treatment (23.3%). The council is ranked 5th overall for the number of traffic light repairs completed within 24 hours (99.8%). Street light repair performance is showing signs of decline, from 96.9% in 2006/07 to 94.6% in 2008/09. The Council is ranked 16th. The number of bridges failing European standard has remained constant since 2006/07. The council is ranked 28th. 	No specific scrutiny work planned.

Appendix 2 – Corporate assessment

Corporate assessment: Dundee City Council			
Corporate assessment area	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
Vision and strategic direction Vision and strategic direction	No significant risks identified	<p><i>We consider this to be an area of mixed risk. We have identified some concerns regarding leadership and culture and the alignment of plans and resources. The change of administration and the appointment of a new Chief Executive provide opportunities for change but also mean some uncertainty as to the council's future strategic direction.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Very strong commitment to the city from members and officers. • Good understanding of what matters to local people. Clear and ambitious vision linked to this. 	No specific scrutiny work planned
	Area of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New administration's priorities unclear at present, currently in taking stock period. The council needs to be clear on these given the financial issues ahead. • A more radical review of spending priorities is likely to be required to ensure that the council can balance its books and align spending to corporate priorities. 	Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress through follow-up to assess implementation and impact of BV2 improvement actions.
Leadership and culture	Area of uncertainty	<p><i>We consider this to be an area of mixed risk. Members and officers are aware of the scale of the financial challenge that they face but are uncertain as to how they will respond. Existing approaches are unlikely to be appropriate moving forward. A Corporate Improvement Plan has been introduced to support change management.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Members and officers recognize the scale of the financial challenge facing the Council, but are not yet clear as to how they will respond. • Members need to make a bigger contribution over a range of areas (leading community planning at a strategic level, policy development, scrutiny, risk management) • Self-evaluation within the council has been used infrequently in a 	Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress through follow-up to assess implementation and impact of BV2 improvement actions.

Corporate assessment: Dundee City Council			
Corporate assessment area	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
		<p>piecemeal fashion and the council's approach to self-evaluation remains at a relatively early stage of maturity.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Little corporate working, and internal partnership working between departments has been poor. • Good practice that exists in parts of the organization not identified and rolled out. Intent to change and early signs of this but cultural issues remain. Evolutionary approach. • Existing incremental approach (efficiency, budgeting, organization change, improvement) which will not be sufficient in current context. Cautious prudent approach limits potential impact. A corporate improvement Plan has been introduced to support change in a number of key areas. • Previous CE was pivotal for a long period. Leadership style/capacity of new CE is uncertain. 	
Planning and resource alignment	Area of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The SOA has an appropriate strategic focus and provides a firm basis for alignment, although work to establish an effective golden thread is continuing. • Less able to articulate how partners will deliver on strategic aims and priorities, but improving. • The council's self-assessment acknowledges that they need to improve at matching resources and priorities. 	Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress through follow-up to assess implementation and impact of BV2 improvement actions.
Partnership working and community leadership	No significant risks identified	<p><i>The council performs well at lower operational level but there are some significant risks and concerns identified in respect of its strategic focus.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strong relationships amongst partner organisations with many examples of effective joint working on individual projects. • Public sector organisations operating in Dundee are committed to partnership working. • Growing commitment to partnership working identified in HMIE INEA follow-through in 2009. 	No specific scrutiny work planned

Corporate assessment: Dundee City Council			
Corporate assessment area	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Local community planning partnerships (LCPPs) across Dundee have been successful in working with partners and communities to identify local partners, influencing partner's plans and allocating Fairer Scotland Funds to deliver projects to meet these priorities. The SOA has brought more purpose to community planning, leading to new community plan next year. 	
	Area of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No real strategic approach/big picture thinking. Lack of specifics on who is doing what and resource commitments. Involvement and ownership of elected members in strategic partnership working has been limited. . Partnership governance arrangements are overly complex. These structures have not supported effective performance management and accountability is unclear. Strategic planning across the community planning partnership has been limited. A genuinely collaborative approach is generally adopted, but some partners feel that at times the council can be too firm in pursuing its own line. 	Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress through follow-up to assess implementation and impact of BV2 improvement actions.
Community engagement	No significant risks identified	<p><i>There are strong relationships amongst partner organisations in Dundee with many examples of effective joint working on individual projects. The public sector organisations in Dundee are committed to partnership working and this has generally been effective with a positive impact on services being delivered.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Sound record of working with local communities and taking a systematic approach to defining their needs. Committed to LCPPs and they work – over 80% of local plans delivered. LCPPs are viewed positively by those involved. Development of Cluster Support Teams has led to local issues being addressed and closer involvement of families and the wider community with schools. 	No specific scrutiny work planned

Corporate assessment: Dundee City Council			
Corporate assessment area	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
Governance and accountability Governance and accountability	Areas of uncertainty	<p><i>There is uncertainty as to whether the approaches adopted by the council in prior years are fit for purpose in the current environment.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relationships between officers and members are good, and the administration meets regularly with senior officers to discuss and resolve current issues. Relations between political groups are poor following the change of administration and little discussion now takes place outwith formal meetings. The council has many of the key elements in place to ensure good governance and strong accountability, and regularly reviews its compliance with governance standards. Expected standards of behaviour and the statutory responsibilities of senior officials are well understood. Elected members have personal development plans in place, but there is some resistance to training amongst members and take up has previously been poor. Senior managers provide status reports on the indicators of the SOA. There is a quarterly performance report to the Best Value sub-committee and a biannual report to the Dundee Partnership Management Group. 	Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress through follow-up to assess implementation and impact of BV2 improvement actions.
	Significant concerns and risks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Elected member scrutiny of decision making and performance needs to improve. Some changes recently but limited and with little overall impact. A wide-ranging review of current arrangements is planned. However, the council has previously not shown that it values the contribution that effective scrutiny makes to improvement. 	Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress through follow-up to assess implementation and impact of BV2 improvement actions.
Public Performance reporting	Areas of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The council publishes an annual performance report and makes a significant amount of information available on its website.. The extent of discussion in public meetings is limited and the council 	No specific scrutiny work planned

Corporate assessment: Dundee City Council			
Corporate assessment area	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
		<p>has been cautious about how it reports publicly to members.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Annual report to the public on progress re SOA, SPIs and individual department performance. Concern re precision of targets/ benchmarking. 	
<p>Performance management and improvement</p> <p>Customer focus and responsiveness</p>	Areas of uncertainty	<p><i>The council shows good progress in some aspects of performance management and improvement but there is uncertainty regarding its future strategy.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The council carries out an annual consumer survey to track progress against customer care issues and the public's overall perception of the council as an organisation. However, there is little evidence of the surveys having significant influence on policy or budget decisions. Good arrangements to gather and respond to the views of young people, such as through the EA Pupil Council.. SHR report highlighted customer related weaknesses in housing management... Strong focus on increasing parental involvement and consultation with parents, for example through Open Voice events. More work requires to be done to engage parents, particularly in the secondary sector, in their children's education. 	No specific scrutiny work planned
Performance management	No significant risks identified	<p><i>The council's performance management arrangements are generally satisfactory. However, there some uncertainties identified around the council's arrangements for scrutiny of performance and decision making.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The council has made a step change in improving its performance in the last few years. It has a well established online performance monitoring database which is well used. Formal reporting takes place quarterly and management information is available directly from the strategic plan monitoring database on a continuing basis. 	No specific scrutiny work planned
	Area of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Annual performance reports to committees provide updates on major projects, but tend not to include trends, benchmarking information, or 	Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress

Corporate assessment: Dundee City Council			
Corporate assessment area	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
		<p>complaints.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Establishing outcome and other local performance measures linked to key priorities requires development. 	through follow-up to assess implementation and impact of BV2 improvement actions.
Efficiency	Area of uncertainty	<p><i>The council's approach to generating efficiencies has been largely incremental, focussed on managerial accountability for tightening control of budgets. A more coherent and coordinated approach to efficiency and improvement is required. There remains uncertainty about the council's capacity to deliver the level of efficiency savings required.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Whilst a specific committee has been established to oversee efficiency and improvement work there is no specific plan of work and no targets have been set. The council has reported efficiency savings of £3.5 million in 2008/09, representing around 1.9 percent of its revenue funding. Dundee was one of a minority of councils not to achieve the government's national target of 2 percent. 	Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress through follow-up to assess implementation and impact of BV2 improvement actions.
Challenge and improvement	Significant concerns and risks	<p><i>Where the council has been committed to improvement it has been able to make a difference. However, there are specific concerns regarding the council's ability to challenge its performance and seek improvement. The council is generally aware of where it needs to improve and has implemented some improvements to its ways of working. It has generally been cautious about the extent of change and takes an incremental approach. This has meant that progress in some areas has been too slow.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A series of 'lean service' reviews has been established. However, these tend to focus on very specific, relatively small areas of service delivery and are not identified from any corporate assessment of performance. Much of the successful improvement activity has been in reaction to external scrutiny rather than being initiated internally. Where the council has identified a longstanding need to improve its arrangements the pace of change has been too slow. Although many of the specific actions identified by the council are 	Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress through follow-up to assess implementation and impact of BV2 improvement actions.

Corporate assessment: Dundee City Council			
Corporate assessment area	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
		generally well progressed, these have had limited impact. There has been insufficient commitment or capacity to make the necessary improvements.	
Risk management	Area of uncertainty	<p><i>Further work is needed to fully establish strategic risk management within the council. The council has some risk management arrangements in place. However, risk management is not yet well embedded and elected members and senior officers have little involvement in systematically monitoring risks.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strategic risk register completed for the first time this year (2009), but not reviewed at a senior level. • Members not sufficiently involved in risk management. • Corporate risk management processes still at an early stage and not yet fully embedded. • Members/officers didn't recognise service problems before cp and SHR reports. • BCP approved in February 2009 but only limited testing to date. 	Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress through follow-up to assess implementation and impact of BV2 improvement actions.
Use of resources Financial management	No significant risks identified	<p><i>The council has in the past been able to manage its finances well. However, there is uncertainty whether existing financial management arrangements will support the council in the future.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Council recognises the need to improve financial planning and integrate this better with asset management and workforce planning. • General Fund above the minimum level set out in the council's reserve policy. • No history of overspends. 	No specific scrutiny work planned
	Area of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Now taking medium term view on financial planning (4 years) but detail not there yet and longer term resource planning remains limited. Not tied into workforce planning or asset management planning, neither of which are sufficiently developed. • Limited long term financial planning which restricts the council's 	Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress through follow-up to assess implementation and impact of BV2 improvement actions.

Corporate assessment: Dundee City Council			
Corporate assessment area	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
		ability to prioritise expenditure to meet longer term objectives.	
Asset management	Area of uncertainty	<p><i>Asset management remains an area of concern. Corporate processes are poorly developed and there is evidence to suggest that the council is struggling to maintain an appropriate and fit for purpose asset base.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Asset Management Plans have been produced for a number of services, but these are disjointed and reactive. • Recent slowdown in capital receipts expected to continue, limiting overall capacity to fund capital projects. • Corporate asset management covers a relatively small proportion of the total asset base. A best value review of asset management is, however, a component of the Corporate Improvement Plan. • Corporate strategy for managing all assets and better linking asset management and financial planning not expected to be completed until 2011. • Asset management SPI marked 'unreliable' due to the lack of robust data on the number of operational buildings and condition surveys. • Major building programme and PPP have improved the school estate. 	Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress through follow-up to assess implementation and impact of BV2 improvement actions.
Managing people	No significant risks identified	<p><i>At an operational level there are no significant concerns. At the strategic level, however, there are areas of uncertainty. The council's workforce planning process is underdeveloped and the council cannot yet demonstrate that its existing workforce will meet its future needs.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff are generally well motivated and committed with high levels of morale and good relationships between the council and trades unions. • Positive staff survey responses and focus groups. • Broad education cpd programme managed online. Many courses twilight to save on cover costs. Staff are happy with the provision. 	No specific scrutiny work planned

Corporate assessment: Dundee City Council			
Corporate assessment area	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
	Area of uncertainty	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The human resources strategy is underdeveloped, with progress in improving it much slower than planned. The council generally has a good focus on training needs supported by personal development planning. However the approaches to this are inconsistent and have not been an effective tool for managing individual performance. Workforce planning is underdeveloped. The prd system requires review. 	No specific scrutiny work planned.
Procurement	Area of uncertainty	<p><i>The council has made some progress in transforming procurement. However, the council needs to develop a corporate approach to procurement and increase the pace of change in order to ensure that it benefits from the efficiencies and cost savings it anticipates.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Member of Scotland Excel Corporate procurement function established but still at an early stage The council recognises that procurement is not yet sufficiently embedded throughout the organization. Concerns about the level of resources dedicated to improving procurement practices. The council lacks a corporate approach to procurement. 	No specific scrutiny work planned.
ICT	No significant risks identified	<p><i>No significant risk identified.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Makes good use of ICT, with clear strategy lined to corporate plans. The ECDL qualification is available to pupils in all secondary schools. 	No specific scrutiny work planned
Equalities	Significant concerns and risks	<p><i>The council has made relatively slow progress in eliminating discrimination and promoting equalities.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The council has introduced a number of new initiatives through their Equality Scheme published in January 2010 which are aimed at 	Audit Scotland local audit team to review progress through follow-up to assess implementation and impact

Corporate assessment: Dundee City Council			
Corporate assessment area	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
		<p>supporting the mainstreaming of these activities.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Greater ownership and leadership in promoting equalities is required. • A more effective approach to Equalities Impact assessments is needed. • There is a need to develop more sustained community engagement with equalities groups, set clearer equality outcome targets, improve monitoring and analysis of equalities data. • No councillors and few managers have had formal race equality training. • The council has limited evidence to demonstrate that it delivers equality more widely in its services. • The percentage of women in higher salary bands is below the Scottish average./the council has one of the lowest proportions of women in senior positions. • The council has established equality schemes and operates a number of equalities groups but these require to be more effective. • Educational outcomes for those in care are better than the national average. 	of BV2 improvement actions.
Sustainability	Area of uncertainty	<p><i>The council needs to do more to embed sustainable delivery of services and outcomes for its citizens.</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A Sustainability Development Governance Framework is being introduced to support the continued integration of sustainable development into all council policies, services and activities. • Sustainability lacks scrutiny by elected members and chief officers. Strategic environmental assessment is not consistently applied to policy appraisal and development. • Energy consumption reduced by 0.4% in 2008/09 (and by 10% 2002 – 2007)). 	No specific scrutiny work planned.

Corporate assessment: Dundee City Council			
Corporate assessment area	Initial risk assessment	Evidence/rationale	What we plan to do
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> An energy Management Group monitors energy management action plan for reducing greenhouse gas emissions. 	

Appendix 3 – Assurance and Improvement Plan

The AIP is a three year rolling programme.

2010-11 (Year 1)												
Scrutiny activity	Apr	May	June	July	Aug	Sept	Oct	Nov	Dec	Jan	Feb	Mar
SWIA – ISLA review												
SHR Housing Progress report and SHQS survey return												
HMIE joint follow-through inspection of services to protect children.												
Care Commission – Fostering and Adoption inspections												

2011-12 (Year 2)	
Issues for scrutiny/improvement	Scrutiny bodies/council potential involvement
Follow-up of Housing Management and Asset Management improvement.	SHR
Follow-up of progress and impact of change programme and BV2 Improvement plan.	Audit Scotland
Scrutiny activity identified as a result of completion of the ISLA.	SWIA.
Joint inspection of services to protect children and young people (CP2).	HMIE

2012-13 (Year 3)	
Issues for scrutiny/improvement	Scrutiny bodies/council potential involvement
Follow-up of progress and impact of change programme and BV2 Improvement plan.	Audit Scotland

"References are made throughout this document to activity by HMIE (child protection), SWIA and the Care Commission. From April 2011 these activities will be carried out by Social Care and Social Work Improvement Scotland (SCSWIS), a new organisation aimed at improving the quality of social care and social work services in Scotland".