

Accounts Commission

Performance Audit Committee minutes

2013

ACCOUNTS COMMISSION

MEETING 14 FEBRUARY 2013

MINUTES OF MEETING OF PERFORMANCE AUDIT COMMITTEE OF 24 JANUARY 2013

Minutes of meeting of the Performance Audit Committee of the Accounts Commission held in the offices of Audit Scotland, 18 George Street, Edinburgh on Thursday, 24 January 2013, at 1.30pm.

PRESENT: Douglas Sinclair (Chair)
Mike Ash
John Baillie
Alan Campbell
Colin Peebles

IN ATTENDANCE: Barbara Hurst, Director, Performance Audit
Fraser McKinlay, Controller of Audit
Paul Reilly, Secretary and Business Manager
Angela Canning, Assistant Director, PAG [Items 4, 5 and 6]
Angela Cullen, Assistant Director, Performance Audit Group (PAG) [Items 4, 5, 6 and 8]
Ronnie Nicol, Assistant Director, PAG [Items 4, 5, 6 and 9]
Dick Gill, Portfolio Manager (Public Finances and Public Sector Reform, PAG [Item 6]
Gordon Neill, Portfolio Manager, Best Value and Scrutiny Improvement (BVS) [Item 7]
Mark MacPherson, Portfolio Manager, PAG [Item 8]
Claire Sweeney, Portfolio Manager, PAG [Item 9]
Sally Thompson, Project Manager, PAG [Item 9]

<u>Item no.</u>	<u>Subject</u>
1.	Apologies for absence
2.	Declarations of interest
3.	Minutes of meeting of 1 November 2012
4.	Update report on performance audit programme and Best Value and Scrutiny Improvement work
5.	The rolling Performance Audit Programme 2013/14
6.	Improving the promotion and impact of Accounts Commission work
7.	Performance audit: project brief – Early severance schemes
8.	Performance audit: project brief – Reshaping Scotland's public sector workforce
9.	Performance audit: emerging messages – housing in Scotland
10.	Any other business

1. Apologies for absence

Apologies for absence were received from Jim King and Christine May.

2. Declarations of interest

Colin Peebles declared an interest in item 9, *Performance audit: emerging messages – Housing in Scotland*, as a registered private landlord in four council areas.

3. Minutes of meeting of 1 November 2012

The minutes of the meeting of 1 November were approved as a correct record.

4. Update report on Performance Audit Programme and Best Value and Scrutiny Improvement work

The Committee considered a joint report by the Director of Performance Audit and Controller of Audit providing an update on progress of performance audits, the *How Councils Work* series, and impact reports. It also provided information on development work to support the performance audit rolling programme approach.

During discussion, the Committee agreed:

- To recommend to the Accounts Commission that the *Renewable energy* audit be done solely on behalf of the Auditor General.
- Accordingly, that in any follow-up audit of the *Modernising the planning system* audit, consideration be given to including a review of local authorities' handling of planning for renewables projects.

Action: Director of Performance Audit

- To note in relation to the *How Councils Work* report *Managing performance: are you getting it right*, that the issue was to be covered as part of the Improvement Service's 'masterclass' series for elected members.

Thereafter the Committee agreed to note the report.

5. The rolling performance audit programme 2013/14

The Committee considered a report by the Director of Performance Audit seeking its approval for performance audit programme projects that would be published during 2013/14, for onward consideration by the Accounts Commission. It also proposed a wider discussion at a future meeting on ensuring that the programme is reflecting effectively the Commission's strategies and the Auditor General's priorities.

During discussion, the Committee:

- Noted advice from the Director that the Assistant Auditor General was currently undertaking an exercise that maps Audit Scotland's income against its outputs.
- Noted advice from the Chair that the Commission's annual strategy seminar would be considering issues around the Commission's outputs against its strategic priorities, including that of the balance between 'new' issues and revisiting or following-up previous work.

- Agreed that the issue of court processing times, in relation to the audit *Reducing reoffending in Scotland*, be included in scoping for future years' audit work.
- Agreed that further thought be given to how option appraisal – not confined to shared services - can feature as an issue in the Commission's future work.
- Accordingly, noted advice from the Controller of Audit that a report on the *How Councils Work* series would be submitted to the next meeting of the Committee.
- Agreed that it would be essential for consideration of future years' audit work to include dialogue with the Auditor General.
- Agreed to note advice from the Chair that the Commission's visiting speaker programme should help inform and reflect those issues arising from consideration of future years' audit work.
- Agreed to recommend to the Commission the proposals for the performance audit programme, as set out in the report.
- Agreed that the Director submit a further report on wider discussion of the programme beyond 2013/14.

Action: Director of Performance Audit

6. Improving the promotion and impact of Accounts Commission work

The Committee considered a report by the Director of Performance Audit and Controller of Audit setting out proposals to improve the promotion and impact of the Accounts Commission's work and improve its engagement with local government stakeholders.

During discussion, the Committee agreed:

- To recommend to the Commission a package of proposals as set out in the report, on the basis of priority being given to activities around reinforcement of messages and engagement with key local government stakeholders.
- Accordingly, that as a working principle, the proposals in the report be applied selectively to each performance audit report.

Action: Director of Performance Audit

- To note that since the Committee agreed a new approach at its meeting on 9 December 2011, covering reports in relation to draft performance audit reports include proposals on how they are to be promoted in the period following publication.
- To note that the update reports on the programme provide an opportunity for proposals on how audit work can be followed up.
- To note that further consideration of issues around promotion, marketing and impact would feature in the Commission's annual strategy seminar.

7. Performance audit: project brief – Early severance schemes

The Committee considered a report by the Controller of Audit seeking approval of the approach to the audit – conducted jointly with the Auditor General for Scotland - on *Managing early departures in the Scottish public sector*.

During discussion, the Committee agreed:

- To note the importance of setting out in the project brief the detail behind the audit, including its strictly defined scope.
- To note that some consideration would be given to workforce planning in arm's length organisations in the performance audit *Reshaping Scotland's public sector workforce*
- That the Controller of Audit consider how to feature in the report the practice of reemployment of those who have already been granted voluntary early release.

Thereafter the Committee approved the approach as set out in the project brief.

8. Performance audit: project brief – Reshaping Scotland's public sector workforce

The Committee considered a report by the Director of Performance Audit seeking approval of the approach to the performance audit – conducted jointly with the Auditor General for Scotland - on *Reshaping Scotland's public sector workforce*.

During discussion, the Committee agreed that:

- The scope include clearer reference (e.g. in paragraph 12 and in the issues and investigations matrix) to business re-engineering and service redesign.
- In the issues and investigations matrix (i.e. issue 9), reference be made to COSLA as the local government employers' organisation.
- In the issues and investigations matrix (i.e. issue 10), the issue of capacity of human resource support functions be included.
- In giving further consideration to the case studies to be used in the audit, that issues such as rurality and dependence and impact on local economies be considered.

Thereafter, the Committee approved the approach as set out in the project brief and accompanying issues and investigations matrix

9. Performance audit: emerging messages – Housing in Scotland

The Committee considered a report by the Director of Performance Audit outlining the emerging messages from and seeking comments on the performance audit *Housing in Scotland*. This was supported by a presentation from the audit team.

Following discussion, the Committee endorsed the emerging messages and agreed that a draft audit report should be submitted to the March meeting of the Accounts Commission prior to publication in May.

10. Any other business

The Committee noted that there was no other business to be considered.

ACCOUNTS COMMISSION

MEETING 14 MARCH 2013

MINUTES OF MEETING OF PERFORMANCE AUDIT COMMITTEE OF 28 FEBRUARY 2013

Minutes of meeting of the Performance Audit Committee of the Accounts Commission held in the offices of Audit Scotland, 18 George Street, Edinburgh on Thursday, 28 February 2013, at 10.30am.

PRESENT: Douglas Sinclair (Chair)
Mike Ash
John Baillie
Alan Campbell
James King
Christine May
Colin Peebles

OTHER COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT: Sandy Cumming

IN ATTENDANCE: Barbara Hurst, Director, Performance Audit
Fraser McKinlay, Controller of Audit
Paul Reilly, Secretary and Business Manager
Angela Canning, Assistant Director,
Performance Audit Group (PAG) [Items 4 and 5]
Ronnie Nicol, Assistant Director, PAG [Items 4
and 6]
Angela Cullen, Assistant Director, PAG [Items 4
and 7]
Martin Walker, Assistant Director, Best Value
and Scrutiny Improvement (BVSI) [Items 8 and
9]
Steven Hanlon, Project Manager, PAG [Item 5]
Claire Sweeney, Portfolio Manager, PAG [Item
5]
Graeme Greenhill, Portfolio Manager, PAG
[Item 6]
Gill Miller, Project Manager, PAG [Item 6]
Gordon Neill, Portfolio Manager, Best Value and
Scrutiny Improvement (BVSI) [Item 8]

<u>Item no.</u>	<u>Subject</u>
1.	Apologies for absence
2.	Declarations of interest
3.	Minutes of meeting of 24 January 2013
4.	Update report on performance audit programme and Best Value and Scrutiny Improvement work
5.	Performance audit: project brief - Reshaping care for older people
6.	Performance audit: follow-up report – Maintaining Scotland’s roads
7.	Performance audit: impact report – Overview of Scotland’s criminal justice system
8.	Joint report by Accounts Commission and Auditor General for Scotland: update - Managing early departures in the Scottish public sector
9.	How councils work series – update report
10.	Any other business

1. Apologies for absence

Apologies for absence were received from Jim King and Christine May.

2. Declarations of interest

The following declarations of interest were made:

- Michael Ash, in items 5 and 8, as a member of NHS Lothian Board.
- James King, in items 5 and 8, as a member of NHS Forth Valley.

3. Minutes of meeting of 24 January 2013

The minutes of the meeting of 24 January 2013 were approved as a correct record.

4. Update report on Performance Audit Programme and Best Value and Scrutiny Improvement work

The Committee considered a joint report by the Director of Performance Audit and Controller of Audit providing an update on progress of performance audits, the *How Councils Work* series, and impact reports. It also provided information on development work to support the performance audit rolling programme approach.

During discussion, the Committee agreed to note advice from the Director of Performance Audit that the performance audit *Major capital investment in councils* would be published on 14 March 2013.

Thereafter the Committee agreed to note the report.

5. Performance audit: project brief - Reshaping care for older people

The Committee considered a report by the Director of Performance Audit seeking its approval for the approach to the performance audit - to be carried out jointly with the Auditor General for Scotland - on *Reshaping care for older people*.

During discussion, the Committee:

- Agreed that, when presenting the report of the audit to the Commission, the Director set out opportunities for follow-up and related work.
- Agreed that the following points be considered as part of the audit:
 - reflect both quality and cost in the audit
 - reflect that double running costs may arise as changes in service delivery are made
 - further in this regard, ensure appropriate coverage of historical context
 - whether the Change Fund is being used for its intended purposes
 - the importance of ancillary services such as shopping and cleaning to some older people
 - whether rurality is a significant enough issue to feature in the audit
 - whether telecare is a significant enough issue to feature in the audit

- that access to out-of-hours primary care services can be difficult for some older people
- increased support to carers need not necessarily lead to reduction in statutory services for older people.
- Noted that the audit would make reference to cost and quality issues in relation to the private sector.

Action: Director of Performance Audit

Thereafter the Committee approved the approach as set out in the project brief.

6. Performance audit: follow-up report – Maintaining Scotland’s roads

The Committee considered a report by the Director of Performance Audit setting out the results of local follow-up work on the performance audit *Maintaining Scotland’s roads: a follow up report*, published in February 2011. The report also proposed a new approach to reporting what progress has been made by councils in implementing the Commission’s recommendations and to promoting the issues again across local government.

During discussion, the Committee agreed:

- To recommend to the Commission the audit update paper in relation to the performance audit *Maintaining Scotland’s roads: a follow up report*, subject to the audit team considering a number of points raised in discussion.
- To note that Graham Greenhill is an observer on the Roads Maintenance Strategic Action Group.
- The proposals on publication and promotion of the report as set out in the covering paper subject to including user groups as a primary stakeholder.

7. Performance audit: impact report – Overview of Scotland’s criminal justice system

The Committee considered a report by the Director of Performance Audit setting out details of the impact made by the performance audit report – published jointly with the Auditor General – *An overview of Scotland’s criminal justice system*, which was published on 6 September 2012.

During discussion, the Committee agreed:

- That the Director keep a watching brief on action and issues set out in the performance audit report.
- That the Director provide details of the spread of radio coverage amongst national and local radio, and that such analysis be a feature of future impact reports.
- That potential issues associated with the audit – for example in relation to victims and witnesses – be considered as part of the proposed seminar of the Commission on issues for inclusion in the performance audit programme.

Actions: Director of Performance Audit

Thereafter the Committee agreed to note the report.

8. Joint report by Accounts Commission and Auditor General for Scotland: update - Managing early departures in the Scottish public sector

The Committee considered a report by the Controller of Audit setting out a progress report on the audit of early severances in the Scottish public sector and an outline of the emerging issues.

During discussion, the Committee agreed:

- To note advice from the Controller of Audit that it was intended that the publication of this report be largely electronic.
- To note the close relationship between this report and the performance audit Scotland's public finances: workforce planning, which will be considered by the Committee at a forthcoming meeting.
- To approve the emerging messages that will form the basis of the report *Managing early departures in the Scottish public sector*, subject to the report team considering a number of points raised in discussion.
- That a draft report be submitted to the Commission.

Action: Controller of Audit

- That a Communications Officer attend the meeting of the Commission at which the report is to be discussed, to facilitate a discussion on publicity and marketing in relation to the report.

Thereafter the Committee agreed to note the report.

9. How councils work series – update report

The Committee considered a report by the Controller of Audit which provided an update on the *How Councils Work* series of reports. The report invited the Committee to note the progress made to date and consider potential topics for future reports in the series.

Following discussion, the Committee agreed:

- To recommend to the Commission that two subject areas be prioritised, namely:
 - Option appraisal
 - Charging for services
- To seek the views of the Commission on the most appropriate reporting route for the draft reports through the Commission and its committees.

10. Any other business

The Committee noted that there was no other business to be considered.

ACCOUNTS COMMISSION

MEETING 20 JUNE 2013

MINUTES OF MEETING OF PERFORMANCE AUDIT COMMITTEE OF 30 MAY 2013

Minutes of meeting of the Performance Audit Committee of the Accounts Commission held in the offices of Audit Scotland, 18 George Street, Edinburgh on Thursday, 30 May 2013, at 10.30am.

PRESENT: Douglas Sinclair (Chair)
Mike Ash
John Baillie
Alan Campbell
Christine May
Colin Peebles

OTHER COMMISSION
MEMBERS PRESENT: Colin Duncan

IN ATTENDANCE: Fraser McKinlay, Controller of Audit
Paul Reilly, Secretary and Business Manager
Angela Cullen, Assistant Director, Performance Audit Group (PAG)
[Items 5 and 9]
Angela Canning, Assistant Director, PAG [Items 6 and 9]
Ronnie Nicol, Assistant Director, PAG [Item 9]
Martin Walker, Assistant Director, Best Value and Scrutiny
Improvement (BVISI) [Items 7 and 8]
Andra Laird, Project Manager, PAG [Item 5]
Mark Macpherson, Portfolio Manager, PAG [Item 5]
Mark Pentland, Project Officer, PAG [Item 5]
Liz Ribchester, Senior Performance Auditor, PAG [Item 5]
Steven Hanlon, Project Manager, PAG [Item 6]
Claire Sweeney, Portfolio Manager, PAG [Item 6]
Gordon Neill, Portfolio Manager, BVISI [Item 7]
Fiona Selkirk, Project Manager, BVISI [Item 7]
Peter Worsdale, Project Manager, BVISI [Item 8]

<u>Item no.</u>	<u>Subject</u>
1.	Apologies for absence
2.	Declarations of interest
3.	Minutes of meeting of 28 February 2013
4.	Update report on Performance Audit Programme and Best Value and Scrutiny Improvement Work
5.	Performance audit: emerging messages - Reshaping Scotland's public sector workforce
6.	Performance audit: emerging messages – Reshaping care for older people
7.	How councils work: project brief – Option appraisal
8.	How councils work: project brief – Charging for council services
9.	Performance audit impact reports
10.	Any other business

1. Apologies for absence

Apologies for absence were received from James King.

2. Declarations of interest

There were no declarations of interest.

3. Minutes of meeting of 28 February 2013

The minutes of the meeting of 28 February 2013 were approved as a correct record.

4. Update report on Performance Audit Programme and Best Value and Scrutiny Improvement work

The Committee considered a report by the Director of Performance Audit and Controller of Audit providing an update on progress of performance audits, the *How Councils Work* series, and impact reports. It also provided information on development work to support the performance audit rolling programme approach.

During discussion, the Committee noted advice from the Secretary and Business Manager that the Commission sponsors for the Local Government Overview Report 2014 would be Alan Campbell and Christine May with further input from the Chairs of the Commission and its two committees.

Thereafter the Committee agreed to note the report.

5. Performance audit: emerging messages - Reshaping Scotland's public sector workforce

The Committee considered a report by the Assistant Director of Performance Audit outlining emerging messages from the audit of workforce planning across the public sector in Scotland. This was supported by a short presentation by the project team.

Following discussion, the Committee endorsed the emerging messages, subject to a number of agreed revisions, and agreed that a draft audit report should be submitted to the August meeting of the Accounts Commission prior to publication in October.

Action: Controller of Audit

6. Performance audit emerging messages – Reshaping care for older people

The Committee considered a report by the Assistant Director of Performance Audit outlining emerging messages from the performance audit, *Reshaping care for older people*. Additional information was provided during a short presentation by the audit team.

Following discussion, the Committee endorsed the emerging messages, subject to a number of agreed revisions, and agreed that a draft audit report should be submitted to the August meeting of the Accounts Commission prior to publication in October.

Action: Controller of Audit

7. How councils work: project brief – Option appraisal

The Committee considered a report by the Controller of Audit proposing the approach to the *How Councils Work* (HCW) report on option appraisal as set out in the accompanying project brief

Following discussion, the Committee agreed:

- That two complementary reports be produced, thus:
 - An initial report in the HCW series setting out good practice in relation to option appraisal, including how it fits with a council's strategic policy in relation to delivering its services, and the key processes needed to support decisions.
 - A future report, outwith the HCW series, using case studies as appropriate, examining current practice in relation to the use of option appraisal; and costs and benefits of different methods of delivery of services.

- That where appropriate in this work, practice beyond Scotland be included.

Actions: Controller of Audit and Secretary and Business Manager

- That the Controller of Audit and Secretary and Business Manager consider the scheduling of this work.

Action: Controller of Audit

8. How councils work: project brief – Charging for council services

The Committee considered a report by the Controller of Audit proposing the approach to the *How Councils Work* (HCW) report on charging for services as set out in the accompanying project brief.

During discussion, the Committee agreed:

- To note a previous Commission report published in March 1998 entitled *The challenge of charging*.
- That this paper be used as a basis for including in the report an overview of progress since then.
- That the report include a consideration of issues around the impact of charging policy on councils' local economies.

Actions: Controller of Audit

Thereafter the Commission approved the proposed approach to the report.

9. Performance audit impact reports

The Committee considered reports by the Assistant Director of Performance Audit introducing impact reports on four performance audits published during 2011/12 and proposing a new approach adopted for the format of these reports. The report covered the following performance audits:

- *Modernising the planning system*
- *The role of community planning partnerships in economic development*
- *Commissioning social care*
- *Commonwealth Games 2014 Progress report 2: Planning for the delivery of the XXth Games*

During discussion, the Committee agreed:

- In relation to *Modernising the planning system*:
 - That the findings be discussed with primary stakeholders including councils and the Scottish Government.
 - That a press release emphasising positive progress be produced to accompany publication.

Action: Controller of Audit

- In relation to *The role of community planning partnerships in economic development*, that the findings that “there is little evidence of CPPs working more collaboratively on economic development activity” be discussed with COSLA at the next meeting with them.

Action: Secretary and Business Manager

Thereafter, the Committed endorsed the reports and approved the new format for reporting impact of Commission reports.

10. Any other business

The Committee noted that there was no other business to be considered.

ACCOUNTS COMMISSION

MEETING 17 OCTOBER 2013

MINUTES OF MEETING OF PERFORMANCE AUDIT COMMITTEE OF 26 SEPTEMBER 2013

Minutes of meeting of the Performance Audit Committee of the Accounts Commission held in the offices of Audit Scotland, 18 George Street, Edinburgh on Thursday, 26 September 2013, at 10.30am.

PRESENT: Douglas Sinclair (Chair)
Mike Ash
John Baillie
Alan Campbell
Jim King
Christine May
Colin Peebles

OTHER COMMISSION
MEMBERS PRESENT: Colin Duncan

IN ATTENDANCE: Fraser McKinlay, Controller of Audit
Paul Reilly, Secretary and Business Manager
Angela Canning, Assistant Director, Performance Audit and Best Value (PABV) [Items 4 and 5]
Ronnie Nicol, Assistant Director, PABV [Item 5]
Graeme Greenhill, Portfolio Manager, PABV [Item 5]
Sarah Pollock, Project Manager, PABV [Item 5]
Kirsty Whyte, Senior Performance Auditor, PABV [Item 5]
Gordon Neill, Portfolio Manager, PABV [Item 6]
Fiona Selkirk, Project Manager, PABV [Item 6]
Lynn Russell, Performance Auditor, PABV [Item 6]
Peter Worsdale, Project Manager, PABV [Item 7]
Kirsty Ridd, Performance Auditor, PABV [Item 7]
Agata Maslowska, Project Officer, PABV [Item 7]

<u>Item no.</u>	<u>Subject</u>
1.	Apologies for absence
2.	Declarations of interest
3.	Minutes of meeting of 30 May 2013
4.	Performance Audit Programme: proposals for 2014/15
5.	Performance audit: project brief – School education
6.	How councils work: draft report – Option appraisal
7.	How councils work: draft report – Charging for council services
8.	Any other business

1. Apologies for absence

It was noted that there were no apologies for absence.

2. Declarations of interest

Christine May declared an interest in items 6 and 7 as Vice-Chairman of Fife Cultural Trust.

3. Minutes of meeting of 30 May 2013

The minutes of the meeting of 30 May 2013 were approved as a correct record.

Arising therefrom:

- In relation to the first bullet point of item 9 (*Modernising the planning system*), advice from the Controller of Audit was noted that he would progress the agreed actions in early course.
- In relation to the second bullet point of item 9 (*The role of community planning partnerships in economic development*), advice from the Secretary and Business Manager was noted that the matter would be raised with CoSLA by way of a letter.

4. Performance Audit Programme: proposals for 2014/15

The Committee considered a report by the Controller of Audit introducing a joint paper prepared for the Accounts Commission and Auditor General for Scotland with proposals for the Performance Audit programme for 2014/15 in advance of the paper being submitted to the Accounts Commission at a future meeting.

During discussion, the Committee agreed:

- That the Controller of Audit provide in his report to the Commission more material in relation to the seminar on the Performance Audit programme on 28 May 2013.
- To note in relation to paragraph 5 of the report that the programme also focus on improving performance and securing better value for money.
- In relation to the proposed audits of (i) borrowing and treasury management in local government and (ii) equal pay:, to recommend to the Commission that:
 - The proposed audit on borrowing and treasury management in local government be timed to fit with the spending review process.
 - The scope of the proposed audit on equal pay be widened to include the implementation of, and implications from, pay modernisation and single status.
 - That, of the two audits, the audit of borrowing and treasury management in local government be prioritised in terms of programming.
- To recommend to the Commission that the proposed audit on broadband infrastructure be a joint report with the Auditor General.
- To recommend to the Commission that consideration be given to including in the programme an audit in relation to dereliction and reclamation of industrial land.
- To note that the proposed audits of Accident and Emergency performance and the ambulance service would allow consideration of a future review of unscheduled care.

- To note that the proposed audit *Scotland's public finances: local progress* is a follow-up report from the report published in August 2011, *Scotland's public finances: Addressing the challenges*.
- That, further in this regard, the Controller of Audit consider how to address in the audit how councils have considered stopping services, and also how councils can evidence their thinking and decision-making in reshaping or stopping services.
- That the Controller of Audit consider how, in the Performance Audit programme, to address accountability issues at local level in relation to police and fire services.

Actions: Controller of Audit

Thereafter the Committee agreed that a report on the programme, reflecting the issues set out above, be submitted to the Commission at its next meeting.

5. Performance audit: project brief – School education

The Committee considered a report by the Controller of Audit proposing the approach to the performance audit on school education.

During discussion, the Committee agreed:

- The report of the audit should set out clearly the rationale for the timing of the audit against the policy environment.
- The audit should address how schools perform against their socio-economic base.
- To note in this regard that such an issue would be explored using fieldwork case studies.
- To note that the audit would 'drill down' into factors explaining variation between councils in spend per pupil.
- That in relation to the study advisory group :
 - an appropriately broad representation of teacher and trade union interests be achieved
 - membership include representation from SOLACE and the Improvement Service.
- That the audit address issues in relation to pupils for whom English is not their first language.
- In relation to comparisons with the rest of the United Kingdom and internationally, that the audit provide some comparative analysis (but with limited comment) of different practices in different countries.
- That the audit address appropriately the issues associated with correlation between educational spend and attainment.
- That the audit address the influence of early years' issues.
- That the audit consider outputs from the SOLACE national benchmarking project.
- That in relation to use of resources, the audit address the level of flexibility that councils have in relation to maximising educational achievement.
- That the audit address the influence of teacher training on resource provision and achievement.

- That a revised project brief be shared with Commission members for further comment.

Actions: Controller of Audit

Thereafter the Committee approved the approach outlined in the project brief and supporting issues and investigations matrix, subject to addressing the points raised in the discussion.

6. How councils work; draft report – Option appraisal

The Committee considered a report from the Controller of Audit presenting a draft report in the *How Councils Work* series, on the subject of options appraisal.

During discussion, the Committee:

- Approved the draft report as a basis for a final draft to be submitted to the Commission, subject to consideration being given to points raised in discussion and further discussion with the report sponsors.
- Agreed that prior to final drafting, the report be tested with some elected members to gauge its usefulness.
- Agreed that the Secretary and Business Manager and Controller of Audit liaise with the Chair on the timing of the formal submission of the report to the Commission.

Action: Secretary and Business Manager and Controller of Audit

7. How councils work; draft report – Charging for council services

The Committee considered a report by the Controller of Audit presenting a draft report in the *How Councils Work* series, on the subject of charging for council services.

During discussion, the Committee:

- Approved the draft report as a basis for a final draft to be submitted to the Commission, subject to consideration being given to points raised in discussion and further discussion with the report sponsors.
- Agreed that councils be made aware of the report in advance of publication, in order to allow better management of any press coverage.
- Agreed that the Secretary and Business Manager and Controller of Audit liaise with the Chair on the timing of the formal submission of the report to the Commission.

Action: Secretary and Business Manager and Controller of Audit

8. Any other business

The Committee noted that there was no other business to be considered.

ACCOUNTS COMMISSION

MEETING 12 DECEMBER 2013

MINUTES OF MEETING OF PERFORMANCE AUDIT COMMITTEE OF 28 NOVEMBER 2013

Minutes of meeting of the Performance Audit Committee of the Accounts Commission held in the offices of Audit Scotland, 18 George Street, Edinburgh on Thursday, 28 November 2013, at 2pm.

PRESENT: Douglas Sinclair (Chair)
Mike Ash
John Baillie
Alan Campbell
Christine May
Colin Peebles

IN ATTENDANCE: Fraser McKinlay, Controller of Audit
Paul Reilly, Secretary and Business Manager
Angela Canning, Assistant Director, PABV [Item 5]
Angela Cullen, Assistant Director, PABV [Item 6]
Mark MacPherson, Senior Manager, PABV [Item 6]
Cathy McGregor, Project Manager, PABV [Item 5]
John Lincoln, Project Manager, PABV [Item 6]
Claire Sweeney, Senior Manager, PABV [Item 5]

<u>Item no.</u>	<u>Subject</u>
1.	Apologies for absence
2.	Declarations of interest
3.	Minutes of meeting of 26 September 2013
4.	Performance audit programme and scrutiny work update
5.	Performance audit: draft project brief – Self-directed support
6.	Performance audit: emerging messages – Procurement in local government
7.	Any other business

1. Apologies for absence

It was noted that there were no apologies for absence.

2. Declarations of interest

There were no declarations of interest.

3. Minutes of meeting of 26 September 2013

The minutes of the meeting of 26 September 2013 were approved as a correct record.

Arising therefrom, the Committee, in relation to the first bullet point of item 3 (Modernising the planning system), noted advice from the Secretary and Business Manager that Heads of Planning Scotland and 16 planning authorities were piloting a system to aid understanding of planning authorities' costs, the results of were to be reported to the Scottish Government by the end of the year. Audit Scotland had been liaising with the parties in this regard and would assess its outcome and the implications for any future work.

4. Performance audit programme and scrutiny work update

The Committee considered a report by the Controller of Audit providing an update on the progress of performance audits; the *How Councils Work* series; and impact reports, as well giving an update on development of the performance audit rolling programme.

During discussion, the Committee agreed:

- To recommend to the Accounts Commission to consider further at its next Strategy Seminar the following:
 - The future of the *How Councils Work* series.
 - How to revisit and 'consolidate' as appropriate messages from previous work.
 - How to develop promotion and advocacy work in relation to Commission reports, involving bodies such as COSLA, SOLACE, Improvement Service, and professional associations.
 - How to most appropriately reflect policy context in published reports.

Action: Secretary and Business Manager

- That the marketing of the *Reshaping care for older people* report, due to be published on 30 January 2014, should be carefully considered in the context of ongoing work by shadow health and social care partnerships to develop implementation plans by summer 2014.
- To note advice from Christine May about a successful 'round table' event held with stakeholders and chaired by Douglas Sinclair on 21 November 2013 to promote the *Protecting consumers* report, which was published on 31 January 2013.
- That, further in this regard, the Controller of Audit consider the timing of the proposed impact report in this regard, with a view to allowing more time for progress to be made.
- That a similar consideration be given to the impact report for the Housing in Scotland report which was published on 11 July 2013.

- To note advice from the Controller of Audit that an impact report for the Health Inequalities report (which was published on 13 December 2012) would be produced in early 2014.

Actions: Controller of Audit

Thereafter the Committee agreed to note the updated report.

5. Performance audit: project brief – Self-directed support

The Committee considered a report by the Controller of Audit seeking approval on the approach to the performance audit on self-directed support as outlined in the project brief.

Following discussion, the Committee approved the approach outlined in the project brief and supporting issues and investigations matrix, subject to the audit team addressing the issues raised in discussion, in conjunction with the audit sponsors.

Action: Controller of Audit

6. Performance audit: emerging messages – Procurement in local government

The Committee considered a report by the Controller of Audit and additional information in a presentation from the audit team seeking consideration of emerging messages from the performance audit *Procurement in local government*.

Following discussion, the Committee agreed:

- To note advice from the Controller of Audit about the deliberations at, and outcome of, a meeting of the project advisory group that took place on 25 November 2013.
- To note advice from the Controller of Audit that the audit team remain in touch with the Scottish Government and Scottish Futures Trust.
- To note advice from the Controller of Audit that the audit team were anticipating receiving imminently the results of the 2013 Procurement Capability Assessment exercise, for inclusion in the final draft of the report.
- To note advice from the Controller of Audit that more work was to be done by the audit team in relation to comparative council spend on procurement services.
- That, for future audits, the timing of meetings of project advisory groups, particularly early meetings, should be considered appropriately to ensure opportunity for changes and refinement to the draft project brief before being considered by the Committee and Accounts Commission.
- That the ongoing review of auditing of Best Value should include how to feature the procurement issue.

Action: Controller of Audit

Thereafter the Committee endorsed the emerging messages and agreed that a draft audit report should be submitted to the Accounts Commission meeting in March prior to publication in April, subject to the audit team addressing the points raised in discussion, in conjunction with the audit sponsors, Sandy Cumming and Colin Peebles.

7. Any other business

The Chair asked the Committee to note that this would be the last meeting of the Committee attended by the Chair of the Accounts Commission John Baillie. He stated that he had appreciated the input and support of the Chair in the work of the Committee. He intimated his best wishes, and those of the Committee, to Mr Baillie for the future.